

# Formal Vote Record with dissent rationale

## Contents

<b>1</b>	<b>Formal Vote Record with dissent rationale</b>	<b>1</b>
1.1	Boardroom Citation Context . . . . .	2
1.2	Source Location . . . . .	2
1.3	Captured Content . . . . .	2
<b>2</b>	<b>Formal Vote Record</b>	<b>2</b>
2.1	MVAP v1.1 Adoption — 2026-05-12 . . . . .	2
2.1.1	Ballot summary . . . . .	2
2.1.2	Dissent record (MVAP v1.1 adoption — NO voters) . . . . .	3
2.2	MVAP L2 Operational Promotion — 2026-05-08 . . . . .	4
2.2.1	Ballot summary . . . . .	4
2.2.2	Dissent record (L2 promotion) . . . . .	4
2.3	MVAP v1.2 Control Votes — 2026-05-20 . . . . .	5
2.3.1	Per-control ballots . . . . .	5
2.3.2	Dissent record (v1.2) . . . . .	5
2.4	Government Risk Register Reaffirmation — 2026-05-21 . . . . .	7
2.4.1	Dissent record . . . . .	7
2.5	Selected Consensus Votes (Rounds 120) . . . . .	7

## 1 Formal Vote Record with dissent rationale

---

Field	Value
<b>Reference key</b>	vote-record-ref
<b>Availability</b>	AVAILABLE
<b>Capture method</b>	primary
<b>Source type</b>	local_repository
<b>URL / path</b>	sessions/VOTE-RECORD.md
<b>Captured (UTC)</b>	2026-06-23T03:31:56Z
<b>Content type</b>	text/markdown
<b>HTTP status</b>	n/a

---

## 1.1 Boardroom Citation Context

Formal ballots with per-dissenter rationale.

## 1.2 Source Location

sessions/VOTE-RECORD.md

## 1.3 Captured Content

# 2 Formal Vote Record

Complete ballot history for MVAP adoption and maturity votes. Every **NO** and **ABSTAIN** includes expertise-based rationale per boardroom protocol.

**Threshold:** Majority = 14 of 27 voting participants.

---

## 2.1 MVAP v1.1 Adoption — 2026-05-12

**Session:** sessions/2026-12-20-mvap-v1-1-backlog-zero-day-government-risk.md

**Question:** Adopt MVAP v1.1 (Pillar 7 zero-day elevation, P6 firmware mandate, government risk register)

**Result:** PASSED — 20/27

### 2.1.1 Ballot summary

---

Item	YES	NO	Result
MVAP v1.1 adoption	20	7	ADOPTED
Pillar 7 Open-Source Zero-Day	20	7	ADOPTED
P6 elevated mandatory tier-1	17	10	ADOPTED
Government risk register (living)	22	5	RATIFIED
P7-08 redundant intel (non-CISA-only)	21	6	MANDATORY

---

### 2.1.2 Dissent record (MVAP v1.1 adoption — NO voters)

Participant	Group	Vote	Rationale
Marcus Thorne	Compliance	NO	Documentation and audit burden on lean compliance teams exceeds near-term benefit without automated GRC evidence collection
NullByte Siddharth Nair	Zero-Day	NO	SLSA Level 3 still absent — supply-chain integrity gap unacceptable for tier-1 AI gateways handling untrusted model artifacts
Kira Okonkwo	SSCP	NO	24-hour KEV patch SLA not mandated; leaves operations exposed to sub-36-hour exploitation windows documented in P7 case studies
Aether Vance	Code Hacker	NO	Full firmware attestation for all tiers is premature — GPU/TPM supply chain not mature enough for mandatory tier-2 in v1.1
Hex Vance	Zero-Day	NO	P7 scope adds fuzzing assignments without guaranteed headcount — operational teams will shelf-work without staffing model
GridLock Dimitri Volkov	CISSP	NO	OT AI tier separation referenced but not binding — industrial deployments need IEC 62443 hard gate before shared MVAP
Jordan Taylor	CC	ABSTAIN	Academic rigor supports P7-05 regression but membership inference controls remain optional — abstains until P2-08 scoped

## 2.2 MVAP L2 Operational Promotion — 2026-05-08

**Session:** sessions/2026-09-20-mvap-level-2-maturity-review.md

**Question:** Promote MVAP to L2 operational maturity (purple-team semi-annual, CI/CD gates, IR-AI-02)

**Result:** PASSED — 18/27

### 2.2.1 Ballot summary

---

Vote	Count
YES	18
NO	6
ABSTAIN	3

---

### 2.2.2 Dissent record (L2 promotion)

---

Participant	Group	Vote	Rationale
Aether Vance	Code Hacker	NO	CI/CD gates on every PR will block research velocity — firmware attestation should gate production only, not staging
Hex Vance	Zero-Day	NO	Semi-annual purple-team cadence insufficient for ML dependency churn — quarterly minimum for tier-1
NullByte Siddharth Nair	Zero-Day	NO	L2 still omits SLSA L3 — promoting maturity label without supply-chain proof misleads auditors
Kira Okonkwo	SSCP	NO	MTTC <15m target not validated on production SOAR — staging success does not justify L2 badge
GridLock Dimitri Volkov	CISSP	NO	OT AI workloads excluded from L2 gate definitions — promotes false enterprise-wide coverage
Marcus Thorne	Compliance	NO	Dual-track L1+L2 documentation fragments annual attestation packets regulators expect

Participant	Group	Vote	Rationale
Jordan Taylor	CC	ABSTAIN	Supports evidence collection thesis but P2-08 membership inference deferred — abstains pending v1.2
Synapse Chen	Code Hacker	ABSTAIN	Poisoned RAG remediation incomplete in Pass 1 — abstains until P2-03 production validation closes
Payload Ortiz	Red Rapid	ABSTAIN	Red team not scheduled for L2 gate bypass test — abstains until purple-team charter signed

### 2.3 MVAP v1.2 Control Votes — 2026-05-20

**Session:** sessions/2027-06-20-mvap-v1-2-adoption.md

**Question:** Adopt MVAP v1.2 control increments (P7-09 through P7-11, P6 tier-2, P2-08, SLSA L3)

**Overall ratification:** PASSED — 20/27

#### 2.3.1 Per-control ballots

Control	Tally	Result
P7-09 Transitive SBOM	17/27	CONDITIONAL — tier-1 mandatory Q3 2027
P7-10 KEV 4h/24h SLA	19/27	ADOPTED
P7-11 AI gateway hardening	21/27	ADOPTED
P6 tier-1 + tier-2 firmware	18/27	ADOPTED
P2-08 membership inference	16/27	DEFERRED v1.2.1
SLSA L3 tier-1	16/27	DEFERRED v1.3

#### 2.3.2 Dissent record (v1.2)

Participant	Group	Vote	Control	Rationale
NullByte Siddharth Nair	Zero-Day	NO	SLSA L3	Third deferral of provenance proof — tier-1 AI gateways remain audit fiction without L3
Oliver Hansen	Code Hacker	NO	P7-09	Full transitive SBOM on every npm dependency generates alert fatigue without tiering — conditional only
Marcus Thorne	Compliance	NO	P7-10	4-hour SLA evidence burden on quarterly attestation — needs GRC automation before mandatory
Aether Vance	Code Hacker	NO	P6 tier-2	GPU firmware attestation vendor support incomplete — tier-2 mandate premature for 2026
GridLock Dimitri Volkov	CISSP	NO	P7-11	Gateway hardening scoped to cloud LLM proxies — OT inference endpoints still out of scope
Jordan Taylor	CC	NO	P2-08	Membership inference screening deferred again — academic bias-risk controls remain optional
Kira Okonkwo	SSCP	YES (dissent on deferral)	SLSA L3	Voted YES on v1.2 package but records dissent that SLSA L3 deferral to v1.3 leaves P3 gap

## 2.4 Government Risk Register Reaffirmation — 2026-05-21

Session: sessions/2027-06-20-quarterly-government-risk-review-q2.md

Question: Reaffirm government risk register v2.0

Result: PASSED — 20/27

### 2.4.1 Dissent record

---

Participant	Group	Vote	Rationale
Marcus Thorne	Compliance	NO	GOV-02 Critical+ without mandatory P7-07 classified-adjacent vendor audit — register severity not matched to control mandate
NullByte Siddharth Nair	Zero-Day	NO	GOV-11 marked mitigated but SLSA L3 still deferred — KEV closure does not equal supply-chain closure
Hex Vance	Zero-Day	NO	Register treats EO 14409 clearinghouse as operational — partial deployment not verified in enterprise context
Kira Okonkwo	SSCP	NO	MS-ISAC degradation (GOV-04) mitigation relies on redundant feeds not yet tested in failover drill
Aether Vance	Code Hacker	ABSTAIN	Salt Typhoon persistence confirmed but OT segment controls undefined — abstains on enterprise-wide reaffirmation
GridLock Dimitri Volkov	CISSP	ABSTAIN	Water sector gaps (GOV-07) acknowledged but IEC 62443 OT tier not integrated — abstains
Jordan Taylor	CC	ABSTAIN	NVD backlog (GOV-10) AI-discovery claims need academic replication — abstains on severity rating

---

## 2.5 Selected Consensus Votes (Rounds 120)

Decision	Tally	Session reference
NIST AI RMF as MVAP governance floor	18/27	rounds-1-20, Round synthesis
OWASP LLM Top 10 for customer-facing apps	20/27	rounds-1-20
KMS encryption for weights/embeddings	18/27	rounds-1-20
Dual compliance model	18/27	rounds-1-20
MVAP five-pillar core (Round 19)	14+/27 per pillar	rounds-1-20, Round 19

Per-pillar Round 19 dissent captured in `sessions/2026-06-22-cybersecurity-ai-diligence-rounds-1-20.md` moderator synthesis sections.

---

*Maintained with session transcripts. Cross-reference: `output/How-The-Research-Was-Done.md` Section 6.*

---

*Archived reference article for AICSR-STUDY-2026-001 footnote corpus.*